

Research Article

Differences in self-discipline between general primary school students and religious-based schools: A comparative study

Rr. Agung Kesna Mahatmaharti^{1*}, and Siti Dinarti²

¹ Department of Pancasila and Civics Education, Universitas PGRI Jombang, Jombang, Indonesia, 61418

² Department of Mathematics Education, Universitas PGRI Jombang, Jombang, Indonesia, 61418

*Corresponding Author: mahatmahartiagungkesna@gmail.com | Phone: +62818587145

Received: 29 January 2024

Revised: 26 February 2024

Accepted: 20 March 2024

Available online: 30 March 2024

ABSTRACT

Self-discipline is the ability of individuals to control themselves and act in accordance with the values they believe in. This study aims to determine the difference in the level of self-discipline between students in general elementary schools and religious-based elementary schools. This research is a comparative research with quantitative approach. The population in this study were 6th grade elementary and MI students in Jombang Regency. The sampling technique used purposive random sampling with a sample size of 100 students, where 50 students came from general elementary schools or SDN and 50 students came from religious-based elementary schools or MI. The technique used to collect data is a questionnaire. The data obtained were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics using the t-test. The results obtained through descriptive analysis show that the average self-discipline character of religious-based elementary school students is higher than the average self-discipline character of general elementary school students. Before hypothesis testing, normality and homogeneity tests were conducted to ensure that the data were normal and homogeneous. The results of data hypothesis testing using t-test obtained Sig (2-tailed) value $< \alpha$ ($0.045 < 0.05$). These results indicate that there is a significant difference in the level of self-discipline between the two groups of students.

Keywords: self-discipline; primary school; students; religious schools; general schools

1. INTRODUCTION

Self-discipline is one of the important aspects in individual character development, especially in elementary school children. Self-discipline includes the ability to control oneself, motivate oneself, and be consistent in performing tasks demanded by the environment. This ability is very influential on children's academic achievement and personal development, because children who have good self-discipline tend to be more able to face challenges, complete tasks, and achieve goals that have been set (Simba et al., 2016). Another finding was presented by Geng & Wei (2023) that there is a significant relationship between student self-discipline and academic achievement. Self-discipline is the ability of individuals to regulate and control their behavior, emotions, and thoughts in achieving certain goals, despite facing challenges or temptations. Self-discipline includes several aspects, such as time management, self-control, responsibility, and the ability to delay gratification (Mischel, 2014). Research shows that self-discipline is closely related to academic achievement, psychological well-being, and success in various aspects of life (Duckworth & Seligman, 2005). Self-discipline is one of the main predictors of students' academic success. Students who have high self-discipline tend to be more focused on learning, able to complete assignments on time, and engage in less disruptive behavior (Moffitt et al., 2019). In addition to the impact on academic achievement, self-discipline also affects students' social relationships at school. Disciplined students tend to be more valued by peers and teachers because they demonstrate polite, respectful, and responsible behavior (Tangney et al., 2018)

Self-discipline is an ability that includes various aspects of self-control that are essential for achieving long-term goals. The three main components of self-discipline are self-regulation, self-control, and delay of gratification (Mahatmaharti et al., 2017). Self-regulation refers to the ability of individuals to regulate their behavior, emotions, and thoughts in an effort to achieve long-term goals. It involves an internal process in which individuals set goals, monitor progress, and make adjustments if needed (Zimmerman, 2000). Self-control is the ability of individuals to resist impulses and direct their behavior according to predetermined standards, often in the face of temptations or desires that conflict with long-term goals (Baumeister et al., 1994). Delay of gratification is the ability of individuals to delay immediate rewards in favor of greater

or more satisfying rewards in the future (Mischel *et al.*, 1989). Research shows that individuals who excel in these three aspects tend to be more successful in various areas of life, as they can direct their efforts effectively to achieve desired goals (Baumeister *et al.*, 1994; Mischel, 2014; Schunk & Zimmerman, 2008).

Elementary school is a critical period in the formation of children's character, including in terms of self-discipline. At this age, children are in a developmental phase where they begin to learn about responsibility, self-control, and the importance of consistency in their actions. Children who have self-discipline tend to be better able to focus their attention on learning, complete tasks on time, and achieve better academic results (Duckworth & Seligman, 2005). The values of discipline taught from an early age can shape a child's character into adulthood. Children who are accustomed to discipline since elementary school will be more likely to carry this habit into their adolescent and adult lives (Baumeister *et al.*, 1994). Self-discipline is also related to emotional control and stress management. Disciplined children tend to be better able to cope with academic and social pressures, which in turn can improve their emotional well-being (Mischel, 2014). Character education in primary schools focuses not only on academic knowledge but also on the development of moral values, such as honesty, responsibility and hard work. Self-discipline is at the core of many of these moral values, as children learn to respect and follow rules, as well as to behave consistently in accordance with the values taught (Lickona, 1991).

School education plays a crucial role in the formation of self-discipline. Primary school, as an early educational institution, provides an important foundation for children's character development. There are two types of primary schools commonly found in Indonesia, namely general primary schools and religious-based primary schools. These two types of schools have different approaches to character education and self-discipline development. School is an important environment in character building and self-discipline of students. Through various activities and rules, schools help learners to learn to manage time, follow instructions and develop self-control. According to Bandura (1977), a consistent and supportive school environment can improve self-discipline through the social learning process.

Some of the challenges that students may face in developing self-discipline include environmental influences, changes in academic demands, and social changes in the school environment. through school rules, the cultivation of disciplinary character is carried out with the initial stage of planning and developing disciplinary character, the facilities and infrastructure provided can also support the cultivation of students' disciplinary character. In addition, teachers and principals also always provide real examples of disciplinary character behavior. In the process of cultivating disciplinary character, of course there are obstacles and obstacles, but principals and teachers together communicate with each other and also work with student guardians in overcoming the obstacles that occur (Dewi *et al.*, 2021). Raffi & Dafit (2023) stated that the role of teachers in shaping the disciplinary character of elementary school students is very large. Siska *et al.*, (2022) suggested that teachers should be more creative in implementing student-centered learning and optimizing discipline as an important character to be developed in students. An in-depth understanding of these factors can provide a foundation for developing more effective educational strategies.

Public primary schools in Indonesia follow a national curriculum that emphasizes the development of academic competencies and universal values such as responsibility, honesty and cooperation. Public primary schools tend to have a more flexible approach to character development, with an emphasis on fun learning and developing individual potential (Kemdikbud, 2021). Religious-based primary schools integrate religious teachings and values in the curriculum and daily activities. Religious values such as piety, honesty, discipline and responsibility are taught and practiced in various activities at school. Religious-based schools often have stricter rules and routines, which are believed to help learners develop self-discipline (Al-Ghazali, 2010). Public primary schools usually follow the national curriculum which focuses more on academics and universal values. Meanwhile, religious-based primary schools not only follow the national curriculum but also integrate religious teachings and values in teaching and learning activities. Religious teachings often put special emphasis on self-discipline, ethics and morals, which are believed to shape learners' characters better.

Religious values can influence self-discipline through the formation of morals and ethics. Religious teachings often provide clear guidance on expected and avoided behaviors, and emphasize the importance of self-control and personal responsibility (Miller & Kelley, 2005). Research shows that individuals who have a strong attachment to religious values tend to have higher levels of self-discipline (Koenig, 2012). The difference in approach between general primary schools and Religious-based primary schools in teaching self-discipline may result in different levels of self-discipline in learners. Religious-based primary schools, with their emphasis on moral and ethical values and stricter rules, may be more effective in developing learners' self-discipline compared to mainstream primary schools (Smith & Denton, 2005).

This study aims to examine the differences in self-discipline levels between learners in general primary schools and Religious-based primary schools. This research is important given the role of self-discipline in children's academic and personal success. By understanding the differences in self-discipline levels between these two groups of learners, it is

expected to provide deeper insights into the influence of different educational approaches on children's character development.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This study used a quantitative research design with a comparative approach. This approach was chosen to compare the level of self-discipline between students in general primary schools and religious-based primary schools. The population in this study were grade students in general primary schools and religious-based primary schools in Jombang City. The sampling technique used was purposive sampling, with the sample criteria being 6 learners, attending general primary schools or religious-based primary schools, and willing to participate in the study. The number of samples taken was 50 students from general primary schools and 50 students from religious-based primary schools. The instrument used in this study was a self-discipline questionnaire developed by Mahatmaharti et al. (2017). This questionnaire consists of 24 items covering aspects of self-regulation, self-control and delayed gratification. A 5-point Likert scale was used to measure learners' responses, with a score range from 1 (strongly disagree) to 5 (strongly agree).

Data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistical techniques. Descriptive analysis was used to describe the sample characteristics and the distribution of answers. Inferential analysis used independent t-test to test the difference in self-discipline level between students in general elementary schools and religious-based elementary schools. Descriptive analysis was conducted by calculating the mean, median, mode, and standard deviation for each group. Normality Test Using Kolmogorov-Smirnov because the research data is above 50. this test is used to ensure that the data is normally distributed. Variance Homogeneity Test Using Levene's test to ensure homogeneity of variance between groups. Independent t-test is used to test the hypothesis whether there is a significant difference in the level of self-discipline between students in general elementary schools and religious-based elementary schools.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Results

The author uses a questionnaire to find out the character of student discipline. The results of descriptive analysis of self-discipline character of public elementary school students can be presented in the following table.

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics of Self-Discipline Character of Public Elementary School Students

	Descriptive Statistics						
	N	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation	Variance
Self-discipline of primary school students (General)	50	40	79	119	99.50	11.020	121.439
Valid N (listwise)	50						

Based on the descriptive test results on the self-discipline character data of public primary school students, the mean value of 99.50 indicates that the average level of self-discipline of public primary school students in this sample is at a relatively good level. The standard deviation of 11.020 indicates that there is moderate variation in students' self-discipline scores. This means that although most students have scores close to the average, there are some students with scores that are quite far from the average, both above and below. The minimum score of 79 and the maximum score of 119 show a fairly wide range in the level of self-discipline among students. This indicates a significant variation in self-discipline ability among students. Next, a descriptive test was conducted on the self-discipline character data of Religious-based primary school students. The following is a table of the descriptive test results.

Table 2. Descriptive Statistics of Self-Discipline Character of Religious-based Primary School Students

	Descriptive Statistics						
	N	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation	Variance
Self-discipline of primary school students (Madrasah)	50	30	90	120	105.32	8.837	78.100
Valid N (listwise)	50						

Based on the Table 2, the mean value of 105.32 indicates that the average level of self-discipline of religious-based primary school students in this sample is at a better level than the self-discipline data of general primary school students. The standard deviation of 8.837 indicates that there is less variation than the self-discipline data of general primary school students. This means that although most students have scores close to the average, there are some students with scores quite close to the average, both above and below. The minimum score of 90 and the maximum score of 120 indicate a fairly wide range in the level of self-discipline among religious-based primary school students.

Before conducting hypothesis testing using the t-test, it is important to ensure that the data to be tested fulfils some statistical prerequisites. The two main prerequisites that need to be fulfilled are normality test and homogeneity test. The normality test is conducted to ensure that the distribution of the data to be tested follows a normal distribution. This is important because the t test (both the independent t test and the paired t test) is based on the assumption that the data comes from a normally distributed population. The following are the results of homogeneity testing using the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test.

Table 3. Normality Test Results
One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test

		Unstandardized Residual
N		50
Normal Parameters ^{a,b}	Mean	.0000000
	Std. Deviation	11.01725832
Most Extreme Differences	Absolute	.113
	Positive	.076
	Negative	-.113
Test Statistic		.113
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)		.152 ^c

a. Test distribution is Normal.

b. Calculated from data.

c. Lilliefors Significance Correction.

Based on the results of the "One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test" table, the significance value (Asymp. Sig.) is 0.152. In this case, the Asymp. Sig. of 0.152 is greater than 0.05, so there is no strong evidence to reject the null hypothesis. It can be concluded that the self-discipline character data of General and Religious-based primary school students are normally distributed. Thus, the data fulfils one of the important assumptions for conducting further statistical tests, namely the t-test. After conducting the normality test, the next step in data analysis is to conduct a homogeneity test. The homogeneity test is used to determine whether the variances of two or more groups of data are the same. The homogeneity test results are shown in the following table.

Table 4. Homogeneity Test Results

		Test of Homogeneity of Variance			
		Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
Self-discipline	Based on Mean	1.787	1	98	.184
	Based on Median	.982	1	98	.324
	Based on Median and with adjusted df	.982	1	86.166	.325
	Based on trimmed mean	1.568	1	98	.213

Based on the results of the "Test of Homogeneity of Variance" table, the significance value (Sig.) of all methods is greater than 0.05, which means there is no significant difference in variance between groups. In other words, the assumption of homogeneity of variance is met. then the hypothesis can be carried out using the t test. The following table shows the results of the t test on both data of self-discipline character of elementary school students T.

Table 6 t-Test results

		Independent Samples Test								
		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances				t-test for Equality of Means				
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
									Lower	Upper
Self-discipline	Equal variances assumed	1.787	.184	-2.494	98	.014	-5.540	2.221	-9.948	-1.132
	Equal variances not assumed			-2.494	93.610	.014	-5.540	2.221	-9.950	-1.130

Based on the results of the t test, the t value of -2.494. this indicates the difference between the self-discipline character data of general elementary school students and religious Religious-based elementary schools. Sig. (2-tailed) of 0.014 which is smaller than 0.05, shows that there is a statistically significant difference between the data of self-discipline character of general primary school students and religious-based primary school students. that there is a statistically significant difference between the data of self-discipline character of discipline of students in general primary schools and Religious-based primary schools. Mean Difference of -5.540 indicates that, on average, the score of self-discipline scores of general primary school students are 5.540 points lower compared to the data of Religious-based primary school students. Range of confidence intervals Confidence Interval range between -9.948 and -1.132 also supports the that this difference is influenced by other factors.

3.2 Discussion

Based on the results of data analysis, it was found that students in religious-based primary schools had higher self-discipline scores than students in general primary schools. The average self-discipline score of students in religious-based schools is 99,50 while students in public schools have an average score of 105,72. This shows that learners in religious-based primary schools have a higher self-discipline character compared to learners in general primary schools. Different educational traditions and environments can lead to different character formation in students.

Religious-based schools tend to instil intensive moral and spiritual values that contribute to strengthening students' character, including self-discipline. Religious education provided in a structured manner helps students internalise values such as patience, perseverance and self-control (Azra, 2000). Routine activities such as congregational prayers, Qur'anic learning, and spiritual guidance in Religious-based schools can increase students' awareness of the importance of organising themselves in accordance with religious teachings, which has an impact on strengthening self-discipline (Arifin, 2013). In Religious-based schools, closer social interactions and strong community support from teachers, parents and peers create an environment conducive to the development of self-discipline. The collective values and social responsibility taught in Religious-based schools strengthen students' desire to maintain disciplined behaviour (Mischel et al., 1989). In contrast, although mainstream schools also teach disciplinary values, a more general and flexible approach to character development may lead to variations in the level of internalisation of self-discipline among students.

Religious-based schools generally utilise a holistic approach to education, which focuses not only on academic aspects but also on the moral, spiritual, and emotional development of students. This approach emphasises the importance of religious values in daily life, which is directly related to the development of self-discipline (Azzahra et al., 2023). The curriculum in Religious-based schools is often integrated with religious values taught explicitly and implicitly in each subject. For example, the concepts of perseverance, patience and self-control are taught in the context of religious teachings, which helps students internalise self-discipline as part of their religious life. Religious-based schools usually have a strong and structured school culture, with daily routines involving religious activities such as congregational prayers, Qur'anic learning and other religious activities. These routines teach students about the importance of regularity and discipline in daily life. Teachers and leaders in Religious-based schools often act as role models for self-discipline. By providing direct examples of how self-discipline is applied in life, students can learn through observation and internalisation of the values demonstrated by their educators (Afifah & Khamidi, 2017).

Religious-based schools tend to have a close relationship with the community and parents. Parents' active involvement

in their children's education, both in school activities and religious learning at home, strengthens the teaching of self-discipline. Students get consistent encouragement from the home and school environment to maintain disciplined behaviour (Sudarni, 2022). In a community that supports religious values, students feel encouraged to adhere to existing disciplinary norms. The sense of community and social responsibility emphasised in religious communities puts positive pressure on students to develop stronger self-discipline.

The results of this study are in line with research conducted by Duckworth & Seligman (2005), who found that self-discipline is a strong predictor of academic achievement and personal success. In addition, research by Smith & Denton (2005) also showed that involvement in religious activities can increase the level of self-discipline in adolescents. Recent research shows that Religious-based character education is more effective in shaping self-discipline compared to character education provided in public schools. This is because religious values are often linked to deep beliefs and daily practices, making it easier for students to internalise. Religious-based schools use learning methods that combine religious teachings with daily activities. For example, students are taught to link academic achievement with spiritual values, such as appreciating effort and perseverance as part of worship, which in turn improves their self-discipline (Amalia, 2023).

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of data analysis and discussion, the following conclusions are There is a significant difference in the level of self-discipline between students in general primary schools and religious-based primary schools. Learners in religious-based primary schools show a higher level of self-discipline compared to learners in general primary schools. The religious value-based educational approach, stricter rules and routines, and supportive social environment in religious-based primary schools contribute to the high level of learners' self-discipline. General primary schools, although emphasising universal values, may need to adopt some practices from religious-based schools to improve learners' self-discipline.

RECOMMENDATIONS

This study was limited to a sample from one city, which may restrict the generalizability of the results to the entire population of Indonesia. To enhance the representativeness of the findings, further research with a broader and more diverse sample across different regions is necessary. Additionally, this study did not take into account other external factors such as family background and social environment, which could also influence the outcomes. Future studies should consider these variables to gain a more comprehensive and holistic understanding of the subject. Moreover, the method of measuring self-discipline in this research relied solely on a questionnaire, which might limit the accuracy of the data. Future research should incorporate a variety of measurement methods to obtain more precise and reliable results.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

REFERENCES

- Afifah, R. N., & Khamidi, A. (2017). Peran Guru Dalam Pengembangan Karakter Peserta Didik Di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Inspirasi Manajemen Pendidikan*, 10(1), 132–141.
- Al-Ghazali. (2010). *Ihya Ulumuddin*. Dar al-Kutub al-Ilmiyyah.
- Amalia, N. (2023). *Metode Pembelajaran Religius dalam Pendidikan Karakter Berbasis Agama*. Alfabeta.
- Arifin, S. (2013). Religious Education and Character Development: The Model of Educational Leadership in Pesantren. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 7(2), 157–174.
- Azra, A. (2000). *Pendidikan Islam : tradisi dan modernisasi menuju milenium baru* (2nd ed.). Logos Wacana Ilmu.
- Azzahra, A., Sholihah, A., & Asy'ari, A. M. (2023). Pendidikan Holistik Berbasis Islam: Implementasi dalam Membentuk Karakter Siswa Di era 4.0. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Indonesia (JPPI)*, 1(1), 174–179.
- Baumeister, R. F., Heatherton, T. F., & Tice, D. M. (1994). *Losing Control: How and Why People Fail at Self-Regulation*. Academic Press.
- Dewi, I. S., Hendracipta, N., & Syachruroji, A. (2021). The Implementation of Student Discipline Through School Rules. *Indonesian Values and Character Education Journal*, 4(2), 48–53. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ivcej.v4i2.30535>

- Duckworth, A. L., & Seligman, M. E. P. (2005). Self-Discipline Outdoes IQ in Predicting Academic Performance of Adolescents. *Psychological Science*, 16(12), 939–944.
- Geng, H., & Wei, H. (2023). The Relationship Between Self-Discipline and Academic Achievement of Chinese Undergraduate Students in the E-Learning Environment. *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, 23(14), 112–121. <https://doi.org/10.33423/jhetp.v23i14.6387>
- Kemdikbud. (2021). *Buku Panduan Kurikulum Merdeka*. Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Koenig, H. G. (2012). Religion, Spirituality, and Health: The Research and Clinical Implications. *ISRN Psychiatry*, 2012, 1–33. <https://doi.org/10.5402/2012/278730>
- Lickona, T. (1991). *Educating for Character: How Our Schools Can Teach Respect and Responsibility*. Bantam Books.
- Mahatmaharti, R. A. K., Ardhana, W., Triyono, & Hanurawan, F. (2017). Construct Validity in Research Development Instruments : The Analysis of Self-Discipline Factors. *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*, 22(6), 33–40. <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-2206063340>
- Miller, L., & Kelley, B. S. (2005). Relationships of Religiosity and Spirituality with Mental Health and Psychopathology. In *Handbook of the Psychology of Religion and Spirituality*. Guilford Press.
- Mischel, W. (2014). *The Marshmallow Test: Understanding Self-Control and How To Master It*. Little, Brown and Company.
- Mischel, W., Shoda, Y., & Rodriguez, M. L. (1989). Delay of gratification in children. *Science*, 244(4907), 933–938.
- Rafif, A., & Dafit, F. (2023). The Teacher's Role in Forming Student Discipline Character in Elementary Schools. *Scaffolding: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Dan Multikulturalisme*, 5(1), 647–660. <https://doi.org/10.37680/scaffolding.v5i1.2542>
- Schunk, D. H., & Zimmerman, B. J. (2008). *Motivation and Self-Regulated Learning: Theory, Research, and Applications*. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Simba, N. O., Agak, J. O., & Kabuka, E. K. (2016). Impact of Discipline on Academic Performance of Pupils in Public Primary Schools in Muhoroni Sub-County , Kenya. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(6), 164–173.
- Siska, J., Afrina, M., Agusta, O. L., Sasongko, R. N., & Kristiawan, M. (2022). Self regulation and discipline development to improve independence students in English course. *JPPPI (Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Indonesia)*, 8(2), 329. <https://doi.org/10.29210/020221640>
- Smith, C., & Denton, M. L. (2005). *Soul Searching: The Religious and Spiritual Lives of American Teenagers*. Oxford University Press.
- Sudarni, S. (2022). Keterlibatan Orang Tua Dalam Pembentukan Karakter (Disiplin dan Tanggung Jawab) Siswa UPT SDN 24 Binamu Kabupaten Jeneponto. *Social Landscape Journal*, 3(2), 32. <https://doi.org/10.56680/slj.v3i2.33845>
- Tangney, J. P., Baumeister, R. F., & Boone, A. L. (2018). High Self-Control Predicts Good Adjustment, Less Pathology, Better Grades, and Interpersonal Success. *Journal of Personality*, 72(2), 271–324.
- Zimmerman, B. J. (2000). Attaining self-regulation: A social cognitive perspective. In *Handbook of self-regulation* (pp. 13–39). Academic Press.